## DESERET EVENING NEWS TUESDAY NOVEMBER 10 1908



Sequel to Bitter Controversy Over the Gubernatorial Nomination in Tennessee.

ROBIN COOPER THE SLAYER. Direct Cause of Tragedy Series of

Newspaper Articles Attacking Col, Duncan B. Cooper.

Nashville, Tenn., Nov. 9 .- As a sequel to the recent bitter controversy over the gubernatorial nomination in Tennessee, Edward R. Carmack,former Tennessee, Edward R. Carmack former United states senator from Tennessee, was shot and killed in a street duel here this afternoon by Robin Cooper, asyoung attorney. Young Cooper was wounded in the shoulder by a bullet fision Carmack's revolver and is tonight under police surveillance in a local hospital. His condition is not serious, Chrmack was shot three times, in the neck, the breast and the left should r Col. Duncan B. Cooper, the father of the young man, was with his son, but did not fire a shot. It is said he stood by with his pistol in his hand. CAUSE OF KILLING. CAUSE OF KILLING.

CAUSE OF KILLING. The direct cause of the killing is a recent series of cditorials in the Tennesseean, a daily paper of which Mr. Carmack became editor after his defeat for the nomination for gover-nor. The editorials in question had been vigorous in their comment on Col. Cooper and his alleged connection with what Mr. Carmack termed the "Demo-cratic machine and its methods." Col. Cooper, who is well known in business, newspaper and political cir-cles in Tennessee and the south, had, it is said, notified Mr. Carmack that the references to him must cease. Another such editorial appeared this morning.

# morning. THE EDITORIAL.

THE EDITORIAL. The editorial referring to Col. Cooper in the Tennesseean of this morning is one of the several which have men-tloned Cooper, appearing at previous times. It has reference to a recent conference between Gov. Patterson and former Gov, John I. Cox, between whom, because of past political con-texts, it has been alleged the feeling was anything but cordial. The editor-fall is beaded "The Diplomat of the Zweibund." and reads as follows: . "To Maj. Duncan Prown Cooper, who wrought the great coalition: who achieved the harmonlous confluence of incompatible elements; who welded the pewter handle to the wooden spoon; who grafted the dead bough to the live ince, and made it to bloom and bour-geon and bend with golden fruit; who mide playmates of the lamb and the leopard and boon companions of the

leopard and been companions of the spider and the fly; who made eider and vinegar to dwell placidly in the same bottle, and who taught oil and water how they might agree-to Maj. Dun-can Brown Cooper, the great diplomat of the political Zweibund, be all glory and honde

FOUGHT AT CLOSE QUARTERS. The men fought at close quarters and here were few witnesses. It was past o'clock, in the dusk of afternoon. They met on Seventh avenue north, directly in front of the Polk flats, a fashlonable apartment house. Mr. Car-mack had just lifted his hat to Mrs. charles fast just fitted fils hat to Mrs. Charles Eastman, a friend, who was passing. In a moment the firing be-gan and Mrs. Eastman was horrified to witness at close range the fight. So close was she that one of the Coopers is said to have charged Carmack with being a coward and hiding behind a woman. Cooper's friends assert that Garmack fired the first shot, but the dead man's friends stouty protest that dead man's friends stouty protest that his opponent was the first to shoot. The tragedy created intense excite-ment throughout the city, and within a short time the streets in the neigh-

Weak Little Boys may become fine strong men. Some of the strong men of to-day were sickly boys years ago. Many of them received

## Scott's Emulsion at their mother's knee. This had

a power in it that changed them from weak, delicate boys into strong, robust boys.

It has the same power to-day. Boys and girls who are pale and weak get food and energy out of Scott's Emulsion. It makes children grow.

Send this advertisement, together with name of paper in which it appears, your address and four cents to cover postage, and we will send you a "Complete Handy Atlas of the World" :: :: SCOTT & BOWNE, 409 Pearl Street, New York

Coopers tonight says that Col. Coop-er had recently talked with E. A. Craig of Chattanooga, a close friend of Mr. Carmack's regarding the Tennessean editorials. Col. Cooper had told Craig; the statement says, that he wanted the reference to himself stopped; that he was a private citizen and Carmack had no right to discuss him in the manner he had adopted. Mr. Craig, it is said, saw Mr. Carmack about the matter and reported that Carmack would consent to no relations with Cooper. Mr. Craig, however, is said to have expressed the opinion that the editorial reference would cease. Cooper had a letter which he desired to send Carmack, but friends argued against it and usered bies de union. Carmack, but friends argued against it and urged him to take no notice of the editorials. Some time after this conference of Cooper and his friends, the former was requested, the state. the former was requested, the state-ment says, by Gov. Patterson to come to the executive mansion, which is on Seventh avenue north, for consulta-tion on a matter not connected with Carmack, and to bring with him Aus-tin Peay, chairman of the Democratic state committee.

After the appointment was made, continues the statement, James C Bradford and Gen. Tully Brown again

Bradford and Gen. Tully Brown again referred to the Carmack matter and advised Col. Cooper not to go on the street in such directions as would make probable a meeting with Mr Carmack. To this Col. Cooper as-sented. He and his son Robin then left the office to go to the governor's mansion. To avoid any possible meet-ing with Mr. Carmack they wen: through the Arcade and up through Union street to Seventh avenue north. Their purpose in taking this route was Their purpose in taking this route was to avoid a meeting on the street. The statement continues:

#### COOPERS SAW CARMACK.

"Col. Cooper and his son went through the Arcade and up on Seventh. Turning into Seventh avenue north. Col. Cooper and his son saw Mr. Car-Col. Cooper and his son saw Mr. Car-mack walking up Seventh street north. going in the direction of Col. Cooper and his son, then on the opposite side of the street from them. Col Cooper then said he would go over and speak with Mr. Carmack and see if he would not agree to stop making the anoving newspaper attacks on if he would not agree to stop making the annoying newspaper attacks on him

"Col Cooper walked across the street and approached Mr. Carmack, who was coming facing him at the time. Col. Cooper had just begun to speak with Mr. Carmack when Mr. Carmack drew his pistol and began trying to fire while a passing lady was between Carmack and Cooper and his son, who had run over when Mr. Carmack be-gan to draw his pistol. It is said that Col. Cooper asked Mr. Carmack to come from behind the lady, when Mr Carmack thereupon fired two shots, both of which struck Robin Cooper, who had intervened in his father's pro-tection. Then it was after being shot that Robin Cooper fired the fatial shot Col. Cooper never using a pistol at all. AFTER THE SHOOTING. 'Col Cooper walked across the street

#### AFTER THE SHOOTING.

"After the shooting, Col. Cooper ac companied his son to Dr. Fortune's sanitarium from which place he was taken to St. Thomas hospital, after the arrival of his brother-in-law, Dr the arrival of his brother-in-law, Dr Lucius Burch. It was discovered that one bullet had entered Mr. Cooper's right breast in the region of the shoulder, inflicting a dangerous wound, but it is thought he will recover. The other bullet from Mr. Carmack's pis-tol passed through both the overcoat

under the skin. Both these wounds were clean.

SHOT THAT CAUSED DEATH.

"The third bullet, which I conceive to be the fatal one, was in the neck. The wound was one and one-half inches to the left of the median line and one inch below the hair line on the neck, posteriorly. The bullet eff-tered the neck and made an exit from the mouth of the deceased. It was found on the street under his tongue

tered the neck and made an exit from the mouth of the deceased. It was found on the street under his tongue at the exit of the wound. Two front teeth were also broken loose. I think there were two bullets fired from Carmack's pistol." The body of Mr. Carmack was pre-pared for burial and removed to the home of Frank Lander, general man-ager of the Tennesseean, and will be taken to Columbia, his former home. tomorrow

### WHO FIRED FIRST?

The combatants were evidently very The combatants were evidently very close together when the firing began, but the question who fired the first shot is in controversy. Mrs. Charles H. Eastman of this city and J. M. Eastman of New York were nearby when the tragedy occurred. Mr. East-man's hearing is not good and he de-clared he knew but little of the affair.

man's hearing is not good and he de-clared he knew but little of the affair. Mrs. Eastman said: "We were walking down Seventh avenue in the direction of Church street and had just passed the entrance to the Polk flats. Mr. Carmack came up the street toward us, smiling as he recognized me. He was some steps away and there were few people on the street. Mr. Eastman and I were near the edge of the sidewalk and Mr. Carmack would have passed between us and the building. He raised his hat as we spoke. He had his right hand up and was about to make a remark when somebody said—it was the older voice—We've got you allright.' or something to that effect. I can't say positively what the exact words were. It never occurred that it was anything more than a friend speaking. Mr. Carmack raised his eyes instantly, put on his hat and ran his hand back, when the same voice said, 'You coward, you are h "Senator Carmack jumped out so as to be clear of me and I ran into a gate-way. I saw that Mr. Carmack had, a

benator carmack jumped out so as to be clear of me and I ran into a gate-way. I saw that Mr. Carmack had a pistol. I turned and said, 'For God's sake don't shoot.' Then I saw Mr Carmack wheel and fall in a heap in the mether.''

Mrs. Eastman said she saw the young man standing over Mr. Carmack and that he put something into his own pocket

CARMACK'S PUBLIC CAREER.

Memphis, Tenn., Nov. 9.-Forme United States Senator Edward W. Car summer county, Tenn., Nov. 5, 1858. He had an academic education, studied iaw, practised in Columbia, Tenn., and a member of the legislature it

1884. He was a delegate to the national Democratic convention of 1896 and a member of Congress 1897-1901, from the Tenth congressional district of Tennes-see. He served with distinction in the United States senate for six years, be-ing defeated for re-election in the pri-mary a little over a year ago by former

ing defeated for re-election in the pri-mary a little over a year ago by former Gov. Robert Taylor. Senator Carmack then resumed the practise of law in this city, which was then his home, but within a few months removed to Nashville. Last spring he opposed Gov. Patter-son for the Democratic gubernatorial nimination, championing the cause of state-wide prohibition. He was defeat-ed.

Shortly after his defeat Mr. Carmack was offered the editorship of the Nash-ville Tennesseean. He accepted and since then had been at the head of that Senator Carmack's newspaper career began in 1886, as a member of the edi-torial staff of the Nashville American. He founded the Nashville Democrat in

1889 and, when it merged into the American, became editor-in-chief of the latter paper. In 1892 he became editor of the Commercial-Appeal at Memphis He was married in April, 1890, to Miss Elizabeth Cobey Dunnington of Colum-

bia, Tenn. IN WASHINGTON.

Washington, Nov. 9.-Senator Car-mack, during his senatorial career from 1901 to 1907, made a number of bril-liant speeches. Although inclined to be sarcastic in some of his utterances he had made many friends in Congres, among both Democrats and Republi-

in editorials, as he was a mere private citizen and should not be subject to

IFIES besutid No oth

BOYS

few days.

ready

253=

Hage Ba well we at

In curto fais, as not vary a mission provided to be subject to public attack or ridicule. "I strongly advised against sending the note, as did his son, Robin Cooper, and also Mr. Bradford, believing it might cause a difficulty, and urged him to take no notice of the objectionable editorials. Col. Cooper assured me that he would not send the note and there would be nothing more of it. "Robin Cooper left the Maxwell house with me in the morning and promised to stay with his father who seemed to be excited, and prevent any possible trouble. I thought the whole matter was ended until my return from the capital in the evening when I was shocked to learn of what had occurred." DEPEW'S TRIBUTE. DEPEW'S TRIBUTE.

New York, Nov. 10.—In speaking here of the tragic death of ex-Senator E, W. Carmack, at Nashville, Senator Chauncey M. Depew said that he was very much shocked by the occurrence and added: "He was an exceedingly brilliant.

and added: "He was an exceedingly brilliant man. He was more than a debater. In fact there was a certain element of genius about him. The last thing he did in the senate was a filibustering speech against some measure that his speech against some measure that his speech against some measure that he party did not want to go through. Of all the many filibustering speeches I have ever heard, that was the most brilliant. He was a comparatively young man and the Democratic party has suffered a great loss."

A PECULAR WRENCH

A PECULIAR WRENCH of the foot or ankle may produce a very serious sprain. A sprain is more painful than a break. In all sprains, cuts, burns and scalas Ballard's Snow Liniment is the best thing to use. Re-lleves the pain instantly, reduces swell-ing, is a perfect antiseptic and heals rapidly. Price 25c, 50c and \$1.00. Sold by Z. C. M. I. Drug Dept., 112 and 114 South Main St. B

Made up Overcoats, Trousers, Suits-tailor made. Big saving. Daniels. Dress Suits for rent. Daniels, the Tailor, 57 W. 2nd So.

#### PRESIDENT ROOSEVELT CONGRATULATES EDWARD

Washington, Nov. 9 .- One of the first Washington, Nov, 9.—One of the hist things President Roosevelt did when he reached his office today was to dic. tate to his secretary a characteristic message of congratulation and good wishes to Edward VII, and king of Great Britain and Ireland, who today celebrates the sixty-seventh anniversary of his birth. The message was cabled to London, but was not made public here.

On the fiftieth auniversary of the birth of President Roosevelt, Oct. 28, King Edward sent a congratulatory cablegram conveying an expression of his good wishes both for the president and the American people. The president was greatly pleased with this mes-

At the British embassy in Washington the king's birthday will be celebrat-ed with a dinner, which Ambassador Bryce will give at the embassy this evening.

HEADQUARTERS CLOSED.

Chicago, Nov. 9 .-- The Republican congressional committee headquarters were closed at the Auditorium hotel yesterday.

State of Ohio, City of Toledo, Lucas County, s.s. Frank J. Cheney makes oath that he is senior partner of the firm of F. J. Cheney & Co., doing business in the City of Toledo, County and State aforesaid, and that said firm will pay the sum of ONE HUNDRED DOLLARS for each and every case of Catarrh that cannot be cured by the use of Hall's Catarrh Cure. FRANK J. CHENEY, Sworn to before me and subscribed in my presence, this 6th day of Decem-ber, A. D. 1885. (Seal) A. W. GLEASON, Notary Public.

In my presence, this off day of December, A. D. 1885.
(Scal) A. W. GLEASON, Notary Public.
Hall's Catarrh Cure is taken internal-ly, and acts directly on the blood and mucous surfaces of the system. Send for testimonials free.
F. J. CHENEY & CO., Toledo, O. Sold by all Drugists, 75c.
Take Hall's Family Pills for constipa-tion.

Phone

65.





borhood were thronged. STATEMENT BY COOPERS FRIENDS. A statement issued by friends of the





Thousands of American women in our homes are daily sacrificing their lives to duty.

In order to keep the home neat and pretty, the children well dressed and tidy, women overdo. A female weakness or displacement is often broughton and they suffer in silence, drifting along from bad to worse, knowing well that they ought to have help to overcome the pains and aches which daily make life a burden. It is to these faithful women that

LYDIA E. PINKHAM'S **VEGETABLE COMPOUND** comes as a boon and a blessing, as it did to Mrs. F. Ellsworth, of Mayville, N. Y., and to Mrs. W. P. Boyd, of Beaver Falls, Pa., who say "I was not able to do my own work, owing to the female trouble from which I suffered. Lydia E. Pinkham's Vege-tableCompound helped me wonderfully, and I am so well that I can do as big a day's work as I ever did. I wish every sick woman would try it.

FACTS FOR SICK WOMEN. For thirty years Lydia E. Pink-ham's Vegetable Compound, made from roots and herbs, has been the standard remedy for female ills, and has positively cured thousands of women who have been troubled with displacements, inflammation, ulcera-tion, fibroid tumors, irregularities, periodic pains, backache, that bearing-down feeling, flatulency, indiges-tion, dizziness, or nervous prostration.

Why don't you try it? Mrs. Pinkham invites all sick women to write her for advice. She has guided thousands to health. Address, Lynn, Mass.

toi passed through both the overcoat and undercoat sleeves of Mr. Cooper, near the left shoulder. "Shortly arter Robin Cooper's wound received attention, Col. Cooper, who had surrendered to the police officers, accompanied them to the station house. "Col. Cooper refused to consent to any effort being made to seever blue

any effort being made to secure his release on bond' for the present. He said, is is understood, that he desired the matter thoroughly investigated so that it might be seen he was entitled to bond before he would ask for it at all." at all.

at all." Duncan B. Cooper is 64 years old and was an officer in the confederate army, with a reputation for gallantry and daring. Upon his return from service, Col. Cooper served many years as clerk and master of the chancery court at Columbia. Following this he was en-gaged in various business on temper gaged in various business enterprises.

gaged in various business enterprises. In 1888 Col. Cooper became the proprie-tor of the Nashville American. His newspaper career extended over a period of six years, from 1888 to 1894. He was prominent in politics at this time, being a close friend of the na-tional administration. He early ad-vocated the re-nomination of President Cleveland. Col. Cooper while proprie-tor of the American brought Senator Carmack to Nashville from Columbia and engaged him as an editorial writer It has frequently been said the colonel gave Mr. Carmack his opportunity in

It has frequently been said the colonel gave Mr. Carmack his opportunity in political life. Col. Cooper was one of the early friends of Gov. Patter-son in his contest against John I Cox. The colonel is regarded as the gover-nor's closest political adviser. No public statement could be ob-tained from any of Mr. Carmack's friends tonight, but E. G. McCord, Jr., city editor of the Tennesseean, is quoted as saying that several friends of the senator had advised him to be careful, and to all of these admoni-tions the senator replied that he did not intend to show the "white fea-ther."

DR. GLASGOW'S STATEMENT.

DR. GLASGOW S STATEMENT. Dr. McPheeters Glasgow, who arriv-ed at the scene of the tragedy scon after it occurred, said tonight: "I found the body of Mr. Carmack on the right side of Seventh avenue as one walks to Church street from Union street. He was lying with his head facing north and with his right arm under his head. His pistol was just out of reach of his right hand and the weapon was pointing south. An ponent parts are known to them to be wholesome and truly beneficial in effect, acceptable to the system and gentle, yet prompt, in action.

The

the weapon was pointing south. An evening paper was lying near his left hand, which held a crushed stump of a cigar. I immediately summoned In supplying that demand with its excellent combination of Syrup of Figs and Elixir of Senna, the California Fig Syrup an ambulance and had the body carri-ed to the undertaking establishment of Finly M. Dorris. The body was without signs of life when found by Co. proceeds along ethical lines and relies on the merits of the laxative for its remarkable success.

without signs of life when found by me and appeared to have been so for about five minutes. "There were three bullets in the body of Mr. Cramack. One entered the left side about two and a half inches below the nipple, and just a short distance below the heart and stopped a short distance from the right side under the skin, crossing the median line of the anatomy. "Another bullet entered the left shoulder and lodged about four and a half inches below the right nipple. That is one of many reasons why Syrup of Figs and Elixir of Senna is given the preference by the Well-Informed. To get its beneficial effects always buy the genuine-manufactured by the California Fig Syrup Co., only, and for sale by all leading druggists. Price fifty cente per bottle. half inches below the right nipple.

cans, who admired his fearlessness and his intellectual attainments. Perhaps the most notable speech dur-ing his four years in the lower house was his brilliant effort in his own de-

was his brilliant effort in his own de-fense when Josiah Patterson, father of the present governor of Tennessee, con-tested Carmack's seat. During his con-gressional career he constantly attack-ed the Republican administration, no-tably in connectin with Indianola, Browsville and Panama revolution in-cidents and executive eneroachment, In the senate he was a minority member of the committee on Philippine Islands. MBS CARMACK

MRS. CARMACK. MRS. CARMACK. Columbia, Tenn., Nov. 9.—Mrs. E. W. Carmack left here for Nashville at 5 o'clock this afternoon. She appeared on the verge of prostration. Her mother, Mrs. Ellen Dunnington, who has beeg seriously ill, was overcome, and physi-clans were called in. Fears are enter-tained for her. The body of Mr, Car-mack will reach here at 10 o'clock to-morrow morning, and the funeral will probably be arranged for Wednesday. It is thought that Bishop E. E. Hoss of the Methodist Episcopal church will officiate. officiate

GOV. PATTERSON'S COMMENT. Memphis, Tenn., Nov. 10.-A Nash-ville dispatch quotes Gov. Patterson as

follows "With regard to the killing of former United States Senator Edward W. Car-mack, who was shot and killed in a street duel in that city late yesterday street duel in that city late yesterday by Robin Cooper, a young attorney of Nashville, I deeply deplore the unfor-tunate tragedy. I saw both young Mr. Cooper and his father in the morning and nothing occurred to cause me to suppose any altercation would take place with Senator Carmack or any one else. Col. Cooper had been very much aggrieved at the use of his name by Senator Carmack and I learned that he had prepared a note to send Senahe had prepared a note to send Sena tor Carmack demanding that in the future his name should not be used

#### It's hille for UU MARK ONDON It's especially fitting that this store should have them. This store has always been the home of quality in any line. Leather goods and General Demand gloves for men and women. of the Well-Informed of the World has always been for a simple, pleasant and SCHRAMM'S. efficient liquid laxative remedy of known value; a laxative which physicians could Where the cars stop. sanction for family use because its com-Quality FIRST.



