

The chief's accounts of moneys received from these sources are satisfactory to the board.

Charge 2, specification "A," in regard to inefficiency at fire. Very full evidence was taken upon this point, and after hearing all of the evidence the board are of the opinion that all of the fires mentioned in the specifications were efficiently handled, and that no more water was used than good judgment, at the time of the fire, would dictate. It is easier after a fire to say how much water should have been used than to know during the progress of the fire how much is necessary to put out the fire.

The object of a fire department is to put out a fire as speedily as possible and prevent its spreading; in doing this more water may sometimes be used than a critical examination of the premises after the fire is over show to have been necessary. The use of water must rest largely upon the discretion of the subordinate officers and men, and the board are of the opinion that in all of the fires mentioned in the specifications, both the officers and the men did excellent work.

Charge 2, Specification "D," that at the Waiter Clothing fire 2,800 feet of hose were laid out, and that in case of another call the chief could not have responded with the hose, the board are of the opinion that the chief should use care in keeping, if possible, some hose reeled which could be taken to another alarm, but in the case instanced the fire was adjoining the Cullen hotel, and the evidence shows that there was smoke in the Cullen hotel basement and it was not known, at the beginning of the fire, whether it was in the hotel or not, and in view of the fact that the said hotel was a large building filled with guests, the commission are of the opinion that the chief was warranted in laying out all of the hose that was laid out at the fire.

Charge 2, Specification "E," with reference to having steamers out of service. The evidence shows that the steamer at House No. 1 has been in service ever since the lack of water pressure in the spring, and that it has never been customary to have the steamers in active service with a normal water pressure but are always held in readiness for a second call. The steamer in No. 2 house has never been in active service since its being Chief Devine's appointment by the Mayor; it is kept in readiness for a second call.

The apparatus at No. 2 house consists of hose wagon, hose reel and steamer. It is imperatively necessary that the hose wagon and reel be taken at once to a fire, as they must necessarily be used before the steamer, and in a majority of instances the steamer is never used at all, in addition to this there are at No. 2 no places for horses for the steamer.

There are stalls for five horses of which one is for the assistant chief's buggy, two horses for the hose wagon and one or two horses for the hose reel, according to whether a one or two horse reel is in service; it will therefore be seen that it is impossible to have a steamer at Station 2 in active service and have it respond upon a first call.

Specification "F," under the same

charge, in regard to taking away 500 feet of hose from House No. 2.

The evidence shows that when the two-horse-hose-reel was used there were 2,000 feet of hose at House No. 2. In putting the steamer in active service, it became necessary to put the one horse reel at No. 2, reducing the amount of hose to 1,750 feet.

This was the best the Chief could do with the apparatus and horses furnished.

Charge five, Specification "G," in regard to not having sufficient force upon Aerial ladder truck.

The evidence shows that it takes from one-third to one-half of the entire force of both houses to properly man aerial ladder truck, when in active use at a fire.

The chief sends out to a fire with the aerial ladder truck, two and sometimes three men; a driver, a tillerman and sometimes a man on the seat with the driver. All of the other members of the department responding to a call are assigned to apparatus which will get there first and which will in all cases probably be used first. The record of the department since the purchase of the aerial truck, shows that only upon rare occasions has it been used at all. The board are strongly of the opinion that the assignment of the men to the apparatus, by the chief, is judicious and proper. It certainly seems to the board that good judgment would dictate that in view of the limited number of men in the department, those we have should be gotten to a fire as quickly as possible and upon the apparatus which is first put in service, and we recommend that this disposition of the men be continued.

Charge 2, Specification "H," in regard to patronizing up fire apparatus and using hose cart with twenty-foot extension and twelve foot ladder, and failure to visit fire house No. 2 more than once a month.

The evidence shows, and the board already knew that the apparatus that we have has been repaired.

The board has endeavored to administer the affairs of the department as economically as possible, and not make requisition for new apparatus where old would render efficient service.

The hose wagon at No. 2 house is not as good a wagon as it should be, but it has always rendered efficient service at fires and while the board would, very much like to purchase a new hose wagon, yet in view of the necessity for economy in the affairs of the city we have thought that the old wagon could be used with safety for sometime longer.

With regard to the hose wagon with twenty foot extension twelve foot ladder, the board listened to the evidence upon the question and also examined the apparatus referred to, and are of the opinion that the ladders do not make the wagon sufficiently top heavy to impair its efficiency or render it dangerous.

In responding to districts in this city to which it is impracticable to send the aerial truck, it is necessary to have ladders upon the hose wagon, with which second and third story windows of dwellings can be reached.

The evidence in regard to the frequency with which the chief visits

House No. 2 was that sometimes he did not go for two or three weeks and sometimes was there every day. The board is of the opinion that this charge is not sustained.

Charge 3, Specification "B." It is charged by reason of lack of management on the part of Chief Devine, there were, on May 26th and 27th, 1895, only two men in charge of No. 2 Fire House at meal hours. This is strictly forbidden by the chief, and if only two men were left in the house on those days the officer in charge of the house is responsible therefor.

The testimony was that the captain prepared the schedule of meal hours; in any event it was reprehensible in the officer having charge of the house, whether captain or assistant chief, to allow all but two men to be absent at the same time.

Specification "C" charges Chief Devine with being surly and snappish, haughty and dictatorial, thereby breeding a feeling of discontent and hatred among the men.

The evidence upon this point was conflicting, and we are of the opinion that the charge was not sustained.

Specification "D," charge 3, charges the chief with failure to harmonize the men and alleges that the chief and assistant chief have not been on speaking terms for months except when public duty has made the exchange of words absolutely necessary.

The evidence shows that when the chief came into the department there was a lack of harmony among the men; that there were two factions and that in particular Chief Donovan and Captain Sullivan were bitter enemies and had some altercations after the chief came into the department; that in attempting to reconcile these two officers Captain Donovan took offense at some censure of the conduct of these men towards each other and that for a time the relations between the chief and assistant chief were strained; that last spring this estrangement was removed.

Charge 4, with reference to favoritism of individuals. We are of the opinion that this charge was not sustained.

Charge 5. The first specification charges that Ed. McCarthy acted as a nurse girl for Mrs. Devine, and that he used material belonging to Salt Lake City in making a wardrobe and chest of drawers for Mr. Devine's family.

The charge that Mr. McCarthy acted as a nurse girl was not sustained by evidence.

The evidence shows that a wardrobe and a chest of drawers for use in the department were made by Mr. McCarthy, but that the articles made are fixtures and property of the city.

When the former council chamber was turned over to the fire department by the City Council, the board instructed the chief to make the necessary changes with as little expense to the city as possible, and to employ the members of the force in making the changes, whenever possible to do so.

There were no closets in the department assigned to the chief, and out of old material on hand, the department carpenter at odd times whenever he was not needed in the other work of the department, made a chest of drawers and a wardrobe which are the property of the city, as above stated,